Kansas in Crisis
Economic Impact of the Coronavirus
Donna K. Ginther
Dean’s Professor of Economics
Director, Institute for Policy & Social Research, University of Kansas
Research Associate, National Bureau of Economic Research
March 2020
IPSR: Social Science & Policy Research for the State of Kansas
Caveats

• These slides were completed on March 31, 2020

• Things will have changed by the time you see this presentation.

• This presentation is based on my readings and data from sources noted throughout.
Overview

• Update on the Coronavirus in Kansas and the United States
  • We have not yet bent the curve

• What’s happened to the economy so far?
  • Stock Market
  • Unemployment Claims

• Policy responses
  • History Lesson—Economic Impact of 1918 Influenza
  • Federal Reserve Board Action
  • CARES Act
In both Kansas and the US, we’re experiencing exponential growth in cases.
Financial Times shows that US deaths from COVID-19 are doubling every three days.

- No bend in the curve yet.

- Death rates in US are increasing at a faster rate than in China at the same time as the epidemic.
Testing has been uneven across the country

- We used data from the COVID Tracking project to calculate the number of tests per 1,000 people in each state.
  - Kansas has performed only 1.18 tests per 1,000 people.
  - Missouri & Oklahoma are lagging with < .5 tests per 1,000 people.
Shelter-in-place Orders are being imposed

- As of March 30th, these are the locations where shelter-in-place orders have been issued.
  - Kansas, Kansas City Metro

Source: By Minh Nguyen - Own work
Data: https://commons.wikimedia.org/w/index.php?curid=88465988
Recall that to help the economy we need to stop the virus

- So far, we have not bent the COVID-19 case curve.
  - Cases and deaths are continuing to increase.
- States and localities are doing more to enforce social distancing.
  - Social distancing is the most effective way to slow the spread of the virus.
- It will take another two weeks to see whether the policies we have now will eventually bend the curve.
COVID-19 and the US & Kansas Economies

It’s not good.
Circular Flow of the Economy

• Factor Markets Supply Labor, Capital and Land
• Output Markets Provide Goods and Services.
• Payments from Firms to Households
Circular Flow of the Economy is Stopped with COVID-19

- Households are under shelter-in-place orders
- Production is slowing and stopping in several sectors
  - Especially Services
- Financial Markets are extremely volatile
A Decrease in Aggregate Demand from COVID-19

• By shutting down the economy we’re essentially decreasing aggregate demand.

• Real GDP will fall as will prices (on certain goods like services)
  • What about toilet paper?
Public Goods & Externalities

• **Public goods** *(social or collective goods)* are goods that are nonrival in consumption and/or their benefits are nonexcludable.
  
  • Public goods have characteristics that make it difficult for the private sector to produce them profitably (market failure).

• An **externality** is a cost or benefit resulting from some activity or transaction that is imposed or bestowed upon parties outside the activity or transaction.
• According to Dean Sandro Galea at Boston University:
  • First, building on the classical definition of public goods, public health is a collective property that depends principally on the conditions that create public health (i.e. the structural, social, and political forces that produce health of populations) rather than on any individual action. These conditions are features of social structures that are not owned and not buyable by individuals.
  • Second, public health, the health of the collective, represents a classic example of shared gain from a shared good.
  • Source: https://www.bu.edu/sph/2016/01/10/public-health-as-a-public-good/
The Stock Market: January 1 – March 26, 2020

- The Dow Jones Industrial Average peaked at 29,348 on February 12th.
  - It bottomed out on March 23rd, and recovered to 22,552 on March 26th.
  - Down about 23% since the peak

- On February 24th:
  - 2,600 cases world-wide
  - 14 cases in the US

Source: FRED https://fred.stlouisfed.org/series/DJIA
Unemployment Claims Set Historic Record

- US Initial Unemployment Claims Increase to 3.3 million for the week of March 21st
  - Previous High was 695,000 in October 1982
  - This was a 1,556% Increase over the previous week.
- This was also before widespread shelter-in-place orders.

Source: https://www.dol.gov/ui/data.pdf
Air Travel has been Grounded

- In 2019 over 2 million people traveled by air per day in the US.
- On March 28th, only 184,000 people traveled by air.
  - This is a 92% decrease in air travel.

Source: https://www.tsa.gov/coronavirus/passenger-throughput
Kansas Initial Unemployment Claims by Industry as a Share of Total Employment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry</th>
<th>Share of Total Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>1.60%***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>1.39%***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale Trade</td>
<td>0.34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information</td>
<td>1.88%***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance and Insurance</td>
<td>0.19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Estate and Rental and Leasing</td>
<td>1.64%***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional, Scientific, and Tech Ser.</td>
<td>0.57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Companies</td>
<td>0.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative and Waste Services</td>
<td>1.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Services</td>
<td>3.34%***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care and Social Assistance</td>
<td>1.57%***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts, Entertainment and Recreation</td>
<td>6.09%***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accommodation and Food Services</td>
<td>6.20%***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Services (except Government)</td>
<td>1.93%***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>0.04%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>2.09%***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Trade</td>
<td>0.86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation and Warehousing</td>
<td>1.76%***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- I calculated the share of initial unemployment claims on March 21\textsuperscript{st} over total employment by industry in February, 2020
- The service sector is and will continue to be hammered.
Yield Curve Was Close to Inverting, but has recovered

- 10 Year – 2 Year Treasuries (Yield Curve) was trending down through February / early March.
- Fed Cut Interest Rates by 50 basis points March 3\textsuperscript{rd}
- Fed Cut Interest Rates to zero on Sunday, March 15\textsuperscript{th}
  - This was an emergency cut.

Source: https://fred.stlouisfed.org/series/T10Y2Y
This is Just the Tip of the Iceberg: The US Economy is Rapidly Closing Down

• Stock Market is Volatile

• Unemployment Claims hit Historic Highs
  • Service Sector is hurting

• What Does the Future Hold?
Lesson From History: The 1918 Flu Pandemic and the US Economy

Public Health is a Public Good.
The Spanish Flu started with an outbreak at Camp Funston in Fort Riley, Kansas, on March 4, 1918.

- 500 soldiers were hospitalized within one week.
- In part because of World War I mobilization, it infected the US in three waves between 1918-1919.

Source: Kansas Historical Society

Camp Funston, Fort Riley, Kansas 1918
1918 Influenza Can Inform Policy Today

- Cities varied in response to the influenza epidemic.
  - St. Louis imposed social distancing measures and had lower death rates.
  - Philadelphia held a parade and had some of the highest death rates.
  - Kansas City was in-between.

- We can think of these variations in policies as a natural experiment.

Weekly deaths per 100,000 from 1918 Influenza, selected cities

- Cities that ordered social distancing later had higher death rates.
- Cities that ordered social distancing sooner had lower death rates.

Pandemics Depress the Economy, Public Health Interventions Do Not: Evidence from the 1918 Flu


• Researchers used the natural experiment of each city’s non-pharmaceutical interventions (NPI--shelter-in-place) responses:
  • Speed and duration of responses to the 1918 Flu pandemic.
• To examine the impact on Economic Growth
Pandemics Depress the Economy, Public Health Interventions Do Not: Evidence from the 1918 Flu

- They find that cities that had faster and longer duration NPI had better economic growth after the pandemic.

Does Social Distancing Matter?

- New paper by Michael Greenstone and Vishan Nigam ([https://bfi.uchicago.edu/wp-content/uploads/BFI_WP_202026.pdf?fbclid=IwAR2-s82W8dpUCu1KjK_fnkuPwSKw0E3TB6SQQzropRbKb9rjg4Qs4u5uwMc](https://bfi.uchicago.edu/wp-content/uploads/BFI_WP_202026.pdf?fbclid=IwAR2-s82W8dpUCu1KjK_fnkuPwSKw0E3TB6SQQzropRbKb9rjg4Qs4u5uwMc))

- Using simulations of the spread of COVID-19, the authors monetize the effect of 3-4 months of social distancing.
  - They estimate that social distancing could save 1.7 million lives (630K from not overwhelming hospitals).
  - $8 trillion in benefits
The Policy Response

The Fed and the CARES Act
The Federal Reserve Acted Quickly and Decisively

• Cut interest rates on March 3rd by .5 points and again on March 15th to an effective zero federal funds rate.

• Using the tool kit from the Great Recession to stabilize the financial markets:
  • Forward Guidance—on the future of interest rate changes.
  • Quantitative Easing—purchasing long-term Treasury Securities.
The Fed is Supporting Financial Markets

- Lending to Securities Firms through the Primary Dealer Credit Facility
  - Low-cost loans to large financial institutions to keep credit markets operational.

- Backstopping Mutual Funds via the Money Market Mutual Fund Liquidity Facility (MMLF)
  - Lends to banks to meet outflows from mutual funds

- Repo Operations:
  - Now offering $1 Trillion to keep Repo market operational.
The Fed is Encouraging Banks to Lend

- Direct loans to banks
  - Lowered Discount Window rate to .25 percent; extended credit to banks for 90 days.
  - Encouraging banks to use the Discount Window.

- Relaxing Regulatory Requirements
  - Encouraging banks to dip into reserves to lend
The Fed is Supporting Corporations & Businesses

• Direct loans to major corporations through two new facilities.

• Primary Market Corporate Credit Facility
  • Allows the Fed to lend directly to corporations by buying corporate bonds.

• Secondary Market Corporate Credit Facility
  • Allows the Fed to purchase existing corporate bonds.

• Commercial Paper Funding Facility (CPFF):
  • Fed is purchasing unsecured commercial paper, thus directly lending to companies.
The Fed is Supporting Businesses & Households

• Main Street Lending Program:
  • Fed will lend directly to businesses.

• Restarted the Term Asset-Backed Securities Loan Facility (TALF)
  • Supports lending to households, consumers, and small businesses by lending to holders of asset-backed securities collateralized by new loans. These loans include student loans, auto loans, credit card loans, and loans guaranteed by the SBA.
The Fed is Supporting Municipalities & International Markets

• Fed is supporting the municipal bond market through MMLF and CPFF.
  • These organizations can purchase highly rated muni’s and municipal demand notes.

• Cushioning International Markets
  • Offering low-cost dollar loans to other Central Banks to support international currency swaps.
Why Did the Fed Act?

• The Fed’s job is to insure the stability of financial markets by providing liquidity to the system.

• The Fed cannot fix the economy:
  • We have a demand-shock and stay-at-home orders.
  • This affects the real economy.

• The longer this crisis lasts, the more stress will be placed on the financial system.

• Read more at: https://www.brookings.edu/research/fed-response-to-covid19/
Coronavirus Aid, Relief and Economic Security (CARES) Act

- Passed last week—provides $2 Trillion to support all aspects of the US economy.
- Something for everyone

Source: Bloomberg
CARES Act

- $500 Billion to make loans to businesses, states and municipalities
- $32 Billion to the aviation workforce
- $349 Billion in Small Business Loans
  - Loan forgiveness and disaster loans
- Refundable Tax Credits
  - $1200 per individual, $2400 per couple, $500 for each child
  - Phased out for high income filers
  - Based on 2019 taxes
CARES Act

- Employee retention credit against payroll taxes for companies that retain employees
- Ability to withdraw $100,000 from retirement plan accounts without penalty
- $300 charitable contribution allowance for those who do not itemize taxes
- $150 Billion to help states deal with crisis
  - Each state guaranteed at least $1.25 billion
  - Kansas budget ~$7.8 billion
$600 per week in “federal pandemic unemployment compensation” through July 31, 2020
- Can receive Unemployment benefits for as long as 39 weeks (usually 26)
- Available to those in quarantine, the self-employed, or people who would not usually qualify (e.g. Uber drivers)
- Administered by the states
CARES Act—Health Provisions

• Hospitals would receive a 20% increase in Medicare payments
• Promote the use of telehealth
• Medicare would cover a COVID-19 vaccine cost
• Expand the strategic stockpile of Personal Protective Equipment (PPE)
• Health insurers will cover the cost of coronavirus testing and vaccines
CARES Act—Financial Aid

- Waives requirements for higher education institutions to match a portion of financial aid.
- Waives repayments of grants and loans for students forced to withdraw.
- Allows institutions to keep unused grant or loan assistance.
- Suspends loan repayments and interest through 9/30/20
CARES Act—Mortgage Payments & Foreclosures

- Suspend payments on federally backed mortgages for 180 days
- Or make partial payments
For Now, Health Policy is Economic Policy

- Actions by the Fed and the Congress have moved to stabilize:
  - Financial Markets
  - Support those who have lost their jobs

- We still have not bent the curve of the pandemic.
- We can’t fix the economy until we stop the virus.
- Preliminary research shows that stopping the virus may be better for the economy than a delayed response.
For Now, Health Policy is Economic Policy

- Just as in 1918, some locations are being more proactive than others.
  - The Greater Kansas City Chamber of Commerce commended @LauraKellyKS for her state-wide stay-at-home order, and asked Missouri @GovParsonMO to do the same.
  - [Twitter link](http://twitter.com/J_Hancock/status/1244020537254346752)
For Now, Health Policy is Economic Policy

• As of March 30th, Kansas has:
  • Statewide shelter in place order
  • 368 cases and 9 deaths

• Missouri has:
  • 1,050 cases and 13 deaths
  • No statewide order

• We will know in a few weeks which of these different paths promoted public health.
Economic Impacts of COVID-19

• In future lectures we will continue to monitor the economic fallout from the COVID-19 epidemic.
• We will also monitor the policy responses.
• I hope that you all stay healthy!
Thank You!

Thank You

Mahalo
Kiitos
Toda
Thanks
Merci
Gracias
Obrigado
Grazie
Takk